



## **Troubled Love Theology and Pastoral Care for *all* Families**

International Symposium, KU Leuven  
**26 – 28 April 2018**

---

## **Paper Presenters (in alphabetical order)**

### **Keith Chappell**

Maryvale Institute, Birmingham / Canterbury Christ Church University, UK  
**Family Mediation: A Praxis in Search of a Theology**

In many countries, Family Mediation has become commonplace in family law matters such as divorce, child care arrangements, elder care, and financial matters. It has proved highly effective in reducing long-term conflict in families and improving outcomes for children of separated families. Yet, despite significant involvement in relationship matters and marriage by the Church, there has been relatively little engagement with what could be an extremely important ministry, leaving this role largely to the legal sector. This paper considers why this might be the case through the presentation of interview data from mediators, clergy, and separated families. Additionally, theological reflection is employed to consider whether current attitudes to teaching on marriage and family matters in the Church are presenting a barrier to a fuller engagement with mediation by Catholic communities. Initial results indicate several areas in which relatively simple, practical interventions could be employed to encourage use of mediation within the Church or referral to existing services. Potential barriers include

a lack of skill amongst clergy in dealing with conflict more generally and, thus, a tendency to avoid issues. Another is a fear of engaging with what is perceived to be a legal matter rather than a pastoral issue. Amongst separated parents there is a sense of failure, fear of judgement, and belief that they are marginalised on separation. Catholic mediators struggle to see how their skills can be applied in a Church context, and sometimes feel that what they do may be disapproved of.

Keith Chappell is a mediator and theologian with interests in marriage and family matters as well as the relationship between science and faith. He has been engaged in the area of conflict resolution for over ten years and has worked with thousands of families to seek lower conflict arrangements after divorce and separation. He is currently a senior mediator with Berkshire Family Mediation in England. Additionally, Keith is director of the Apologetics MA pathway at the Maryvale Institute, Birmingham, England and associate Research Fellow at Canterbury Christ Church University where he researches the impact of conflict models of science and faith in education. He holds doctorates in biological sciences from the University of Hull, England and also in theology from the University of Oxford. He has published widely in the fields of biological science, education, science and religion, and theology; including in the *INTAMS Review*. His latest book *A Teacher's Guide to Science and Religion in the Classroom* is published by Routledge. His next book *Science, Religion and Education* is due to be published later this year by Springer. Previous books include *Catholic Social Conscience* published by Gracewing, and *The Role of the Christian Father* published by CTS.

### **David Dawson Vasquez**

Pontifical Beda College / Pontifical University of St. Thomas Aquinas  
**Insights from Gregory of Nyssa on Marriage Irregularity**

As is well known, when one goes searching in the theological writings of the early Church, one is hard pressed to find a defense of marriage as the highest expression of human life; that award inevitably goes to the virginal lifestyle. While marriage is always seen as a good, it is seen as a secondary path to holiness. Gregory of Nyssa is no exception, yet he does present an interesting account of the relationship between marriage and virginity. Marriage becomes praiseworthy when the love for the spouses becomes the love for God and marital love passes into virginal love. In this paper, I argue that rather than reading this as a problem symptomatic of the ascetic tradition's unease with marriage, Gregory's treatment offers remarkable insight into the inner dynamic of marriage and highlights its central grace-filled core that connects it with the pure love of virginity.

There is a real sense that, for Gregory, a regular marriage tends towards irregularity under the influence of grace. Now, Gregory is far from affirming today's irregular situations. However, the way that he situates the tension between regular and irregular on the one hand and (sinful) nature and grace on the other can provide important theological insight into the Christian essence of marriage. These insights, I argue, can be extrapolated to shed some light on irregular relationships today and thus provide possibilities for rethinking the boundaries of human relationality.

David Dawson Vasquez teaches dogmatic theology at the Pontifical Beda College, the Pontifical University of St. Thomas Aquinas (Angelicum), and the Accademia Alfonsiana in Rome. He holds a Ph.D. in Systematic Theology from The Catholic University of America and has been teaching theology in Rome to undergraduates and postgraduates at various institutions since 2001. His interests are theological anthropology, the apophatic tradition, and the intersection between philosophical thought and the arts and liturgy. He is Associate Editor of the INTAMS journal *Marriage, Families & Spirituality*.

### **Nadia Delicata**

University of Malta

#### **Accompanying the Spiritually Wounded**

*Amoris laetitia*, in particular Chapter 8, invites us to rediscover the church's traditional pastoral praxis that is oriented not merely to judging acts but to healing the spiritually wounded. Through spiritual accompaniment, the penitent is offered the space to become more attentive to their situation before God, to seek conversion and to appropriate more fully their responsibility, as they slowly learn to be open to accepting God's healing mercy. The aim of this paper is to unpack the different aspects of this process of accompaniment that relies on discernment aimed towards greater integration. First, Pope Francis's dictum "time is greater than space" is developed to highlight the attitudes necessary for spiritual directors and confessors as they accompany those in so-called "irregular" situations. Next, the paper will explore the doctrinal continuity between the more "legalistic" approach of FC 84, and the more "therapeutic" approach of AL 8, to unpack the meaning of the "integration" that the process of accompaniment aims towards. The importance of integration must be understood in two senses: the gradual personal re-integration of the wounded person, and their re-integration in the community. In the third part, I will contrast the traditional confessional praxis that aims to examine culpability with the equally traditional praxis of accompanying the penitent

to tell their story. In the latter case, we see how even determining the morality of the act depends on a process of discernment as the person deepens their own self-understanding.

Nadia Delicata is Senior Lecturer in Fundamental Moral Theology and Christianity and Culture at the Department of Moral and Spiritual Theology, Faculty of Theology, University of Malta.

### **Kartharine Ebner**

University of Bonn

#### **What do German Dioceses Have to Offer Families? A Survey of Different Approaches and Programmes**

Approaches to and programmes for the pastoral, spiritual, and every-day needs of families vary considerably among German dioceses in their extent as well in content. The aim of this paper is to investigate the various current measures German dioceses provide for the needs of families and subsequently explore their underlying presuppositions. What do those measures consist of? Who are they directed at? Do they embrace the particular needs of different family constellations? Along with a comprehensive overview, I will further assess respective strengths and weaknesses on the basis of selected examples.

Dr. Katharina Ebner is a research associate at the Chair of Moral Theology at the University of Bonn. She is a Catholic theologian working on questions of religion, family, sexuality, and gender in the twentieth century. At present, she is engaged in a project pursuing the specific opportunities and challenges of non-traditional family ways of life. Her doctoral thesis on religious references in parliamentary debates on homosexuality is currently in press.

### **Doral Hayes**

Association of Interchurch Families, UK

#### **What About the Children? What Were the Fears and Hopes of Interchurch Parents for Their Children in 1970, and Have Developments over 50 years any Relevance for the Church Today?**

This paper explores the fears and hopes of interchurch parents for their children. In 2018 the Association of Interchurch Families in the UK celebrates its 50th Anniversary; in 1968 mixed marriages were considered a "primary and crucial ecumenical problem" (Secretariat for Promoting Christian Unity Information Service 1967, 3, p. 9). The Roman Catholic Church refused to recognise a marriage between a Catholic and a

Christian of another communion unless both partners promised the children would be baptised and brought up in the Catholic Church. This approach antagonised other churches, who felt the rights and consciences of their members were being ignored. The Council changed the climate, committing the Catholic Church to the ecumenical movement, to respect for conscience and to marriage as a vocation, although old attitudes lingered. In 1968 it was tentatively suggested that it might be possible to bring up children within two churches; many saw this as an impossible dream, for psychological, theological, and practical reasons. Yet some interchurch families dared to hope that it might prepare the way for that visible unity in Christ to which the churches were now committed. Would they receive a pastoral response? In 1970 new Catholic legislation made a more flexible approach possible, further raising these hopes. This paper proposes that it is time to examine the lived experience of interchurch families, understand whether their fears and hopes have been fulfilled, and to hear the testimony of interchurch children asking what relevance this might have for the church today.

Doral Hayes is the Executive Development Officer for the Association of Interchurch Families in the UK. Doral is currently studying at Newman University, Birmingham, UK for an MA in Contemporary Christian Theology and writing a dissertation on the impact of being raised as an interchurch child on adult faith formation. Doral is a lay leader and preacher in Wycombe Deanery in the Anglican Diocese of Oxford, UK as well as wife to Declan and mother to Amelia and Dylan.

### **Joann Heaney-Hunter**

St. John's University, Jamaica, NY, USA

#### **Re-visioning Domestic Church in Light of *Amoris laetitia***

Twentieth century Catholic documents have established standards for marriage and family life to be considered a “domestic church”. *Gaudium et spes* and *Familiaris consortio*, for example, presuppose that the family springs from Christian marriage. In today’s society, many families differ from this norm, and represent diverse structures. This paper explores the family as Domestic Church through the lens of *Amoris laetitia*, which, I suggest, can lead us to a broader definition of faithful family. While previous documents often implied that only heterosexual married couples could lead “domestic churches” *Amoris laetitia* opens the door to understanding domestic church as a family that springs from love. Francis articulates in chapter four a deep and profound reading of 1 Corinthians 13, and asks readers to consider what it would mean for families to be infused

with this depth of love. Understanding domestic church as a community springing from love allows us to define family in a way that reflects the variety of structures we see today. Another element of *Amoris laetitia* that must be considered is Francis’s perspective on conscience. He asserts the priority of informed conscience, even if it takes one beyond the official teaching of the church. Family members using informed conscience to make decisions about structure must be respected.

In this paper, I explore domestic church through the lens of Francis’s understanding of love and conscience in *Amoris laetitia*. His perspective, I believe, can help diverse families understand themselves as making Christ present in their homes.

Joann Heaney-Hunter teaches pastoral theology and pastoral care and counselling at St. John's University, New York. She holds a Ph.D. in Theology from Fordham University and an M.S. in Mental Health Counseling from Long Island University. She maintains national board certification in professional counselling, is a Fellow of the American Association of Pastoral Counselors, and is licensed to practice mental health counselling in New York State. Her specialization is working with couples and families through the life cycle. In December 2015, she received a \$596,847 grant from the Lilly Endowment to present a Vincentian Summer High School Theology Institute, which began in July 2017. Dr. Heaney-Hunter serves as the grant's project director. The Institute introduces high school students to Vincentian spirituality through the lens of social justice and aims to help students grow as young Catholic leaders in their schools and parishes. In July 2016, she delivered a paper at an international conference on the lay vocation, held in honour of the 30th anniversary of the Lay Centre in Rome. The paper, “Planting the Seeds of the Lay Vocation: Evangelizing Teens?” presented the framework of the Vincentian Theology Institute as a model for evangelizing Catholic youth. Other recent scholarship includes work on the connections between positive psychology and family ministry. Dr. Heaney-Hunter serves as a retreat director at the Loyola Jesuit Center in Morristown, New Jersey, and is a member of the Board of Trustees at St. Joseph's Seminary in Yonkers, New York, and the Loyola Jesuit Center.

### **David G. Hunter**

University of Kentucky, USA

#### **Troubled Love in the Early Church: Was Remarriage after Divorce Absolutely Forbidden?**

In the later years of the fourth century, an anonymous biblical commentator, now called “Ambrosiaster”, published the first complete commentary on the epistles of St. Paul. In the course of his remarks on 1

Corinthians 7, Ambrosiaster noted that divorce was allowed to those Christians whose spouses were guilty of adultery. But Ambrosiaster argued that Paul taught that remarriage after such a divorce was allowed only to men, not to women. While some influential scholars (e.g., Henri Crouzel) have argued that Ambrosiaster's position was an anomaly in the western church, in this presentation I will suggest that his view may have been the dominant one prior to Augustine.

David G. Hunter holds the Cottrill-Rolfes Chair of Catholic Studies at the University of Kentucky. He has published several books and numerous articles on Greek and Latin writers of the early church, among them Augustine, Ambrose, Ambrosiaster, Jerome, and John Chrysostom. His monograph, *Marriage, Celibacy, and Heresy in Ancient Christianity: The Jovinianist Controversy* (Oxford University Press, 2007), studies the phenomenon of resistance to asceticism in early Christianity. Co-editor of the *Oxford Handbook of Early Christian Studies* (2008), Hunter is currently director of the Fathers of the Church, a series of translations published by The Catholic University of America Press, and a general editor of the forthcoming *Brill Encyclopedia of Early Christianity*. His latest book is titled *Marriage and Sexuality in Ancient Christianity*.

### **Ma. Marilou S. Ibita**

KU Leuven

#### **Biblical Trauma Hermeneutics and Ministry to Mothers, Orphans, and Widows in the “Drug War” in the Philippines**

Filipino families, especially among the poor, that do not live according to the Roman Catholic ideal of formal, lifelong, and heterosexual marriage are facing various challenges. One of these is drug addiction made more complicated by the controversial “war on drugs” by the Duterte administration in the Philippines. As of 23 January 2018, there have been 4,355 people killed in addition to 16,355 “deaths under investigation”; many if not most are also drug related. In the Catholic-dominated Philippines, this dreadful scenario results in personal tragedies and various pastoral challenges. Apart from documenting the dead and upholding their rights, the Church is also faced with the need to minister to and walk with the survivors, the mothers, the widows, and the orphaned children of the victims who are mostly economically disadvantaged. This paper first explores some of these challenges as well as the existing pastoral responses and initiatives. Then we turn to biblical trauma hermeneutics, one of the missing but potentially helpful initiatives, as a way to help people grapple with trauma from a faith perspective. Trauma hermeneutics does

not usually form part of biblical formation in seminary or religious studies programs or pastoral formation in the parishes. Yet the results of the “war on drugs” necessitate multiple levels of intervention, including post-traumatic accompaniment for the survivors and those who help them. This paper posits that trauma hermeneutics is increasingly needed for a biblical-theological and pastoral formation of church workers who respond to the consequences of the “war on drugs” as a way to support these vulnerable and traumatized families in their local and basic ecclesial contexts.

Ma. Marilou S. Ibita finished her PhD and STD in 2012 at the Faculty of Theology and Religious Studies, KU Leuven, with a specialization in New Testament exegesis. Her dissertation was entitled “If Anyone Hungers, He/She Must Eat in the House? (1 Cor 11:34): A Narrative-Critical, Socio-Historical and Grammatical-Philological Analysis of the Story of the Lord’s Supper in Corinth (1 Cor 11:17-34)”. She is currently working as Post-Doctoral Researcher at the Centre for Academic Teacher Training of the Faculty of Theology and Religious Studies, KU Leuven, Belgium. In first semester of 2017-2018, she taught Contextual Hermeneutical Approaches to the Bible at the Faculty of Theology and Religious Studies. In the Philippines, she taught various classes in Biblical Studies, particularly Introduction to the Bible, Introduction to the New Testament, Synoptics and Acts, biblical methodologies and hermeneutics. In addition to these topics, her research interests, academic conference presentations and publications concern the canonical Gospels, the Pauline Letters, contextual biblical hermeneutics and methodologies, economics and social stratification in the Bible, ecological hermeneutics, popularization of the Bible, adult faith education, faith that does justice, sustainability research, UN SDG 2030 and the Catholic faith. Her latest presentation entitled “Super Typhoon, Spirits and Scriptures: Exploring Post-Traumatic and Ecological Challenges and Responses in a Post-Haiyan Context” was delivered at the Annual Meeting of the Society of Biblical Literature in Boston, MA (21 November 2017).

### **Tina Lasquety-Reyes**

University of Hamburg

#### **Heavenly Love in Troubled Love**

In what many have called the Summa of Hildegard of Bingen's works, her play, *The Play of the Virtues*, introduces an unusual character: the virtue Heavenly Love. Heavenly Love embodies the highest ideals of love – a love desiring heaven and a love finding completion in God. Upon further investigation of the virtue, we find that the virtue is more than simply an ideal concept but rather a complex and enduring one. Conjugal ethicist Hildegard of Bingen has placed this virtue in the midst of the realities of a

wounded soul and world. My presentation will draw from this example and apply and problematize its concepts within a non-traditional familial context, namely, long-distance marriages. I argue that the virtue of heavenly love is not only at work, but can also be strengthened, within such marital contexts. I will also look at how heavenly love is essential within the troubled love of marriages under the burden of distance and how it can actually sustain marriages.

Tina Lasquety-Reyes is a doctoral student based at the University of Hamburg, Germany. Her research looks at the works of Hildegard of Bingen in which she is currently developing a theology of healing informed by both Hildegard's works and also contemporary theological and philosophical texts. Tina received theological training and graduate degrees from the KU Leuven Faculty of Theology and Religious Studies. She is also the Executive Director of Christa Apostolate, a nonprofit organization that addresses healing within intimate and interpersonal relationships.

### **Anselm Theodos Ngetwa**

KU Leuven

#### **The Place of An Empowerment and Capabilities Approach in the Divorce and Remarriage Debate with Special Focus on *Amoris Laetitia***

Although *Amoris laetitia* gives the impression of using the empowerment and the capabilities approach widely discussed in relation to poverty (Gutiérrez, 1983), development (Sen, 1999) and women (Nussbaum, 2000), a careful reading reveals a top down and even paternalistic tone. Notwithstanding Pope Francis's focus on discernment, it emphasizes that ministers have the responsibility and duty to help, assist, and accompany those in irregular situations and that the Church assists them via a solid body of reflection. As such, the Church presents herself as a teacher while those in irregular situations are considered as pupils. In doing so, one cannot avoid the impression that priests are playing a more active, powerful, and decisive role than those seeking help in relation to divorce and remarriage. This paper re-interprets *Amoris laetitia* through the lens of the empowerment and capabilities approach. It allows for taking those who are divorced and remarried to be the starting and returning point of reflection, the basis for discernment in which ministers are not only teachers but also learners (Watkins, 2016). This approach creates the indispensable and favourable conditions in which these people become the agents of their own discernment by sharing their experiences and by

participating actively in the dialogue. If the Church wants to accompany and to care for people who are divorced and remarried effectively, I would argue that the discourse of *Amoris laetitia* should move from appearing to present a top-down and paternalistic approach to presenting a more dialogical and empowering one.

Anselm Theodos Ngetwa is a Tanzanian member of the Missionaries of Africa (White Fathers). He is currently a doctoral student at the Faculty of Theology (Theological Ethics) at KU Leuven under the supervision of Professor Johan Verstraeten. Before starting his doctoral research, he taught at the Institut Catholique Missionnaire d'Abidjan (in Ivory Coast) from 2011 to 2015. His interests are in the field of Poverty, Social Justice, the Common Good, Liberation Theology, women's Empowerment and Ethics from an African perspective. In this respect, he has written a book entitled *Commitment to the Common Good: The Basis for Empowerment and Liberation of Poor People* (Saarbrücken, LAP Lambert, 2013). The title of his doctoral thesis is: "Mwalimu Nyerere's Fundamental Option for Poor People and for People-Centred Development, with a Special Focus on the Influence of Christian Faith and Ethics, and on the Tension between Development and Liberation Paradigms".

### **Elzbieta Osewska**

State Higher Vocational School in Tarnów

#### **Pastoral Care of Single Mothers in Poland**

Almost every fifth Polish family is single parent one. In the overwhelming majority (over 90%) the child is raised by the mother. According to data from the Central Statistical Office in Poland, single mothers in cities account for more than half of women aged 25-49, while in rural areas more than 50% of single mothers are women over fifty. Single mothers are usually divorced women, less often very young, unmarried women and widows. The vast majority of them care for one child. Approx. 9% of single mothers bring up at least three children. In the most complicated situation are young women in the villages who do not have a stable life situation. In these cases, the help of the family is indispensable – thanks to this, a young girl can finish school and look for a job. It is estimated that every year in Poland there are about 20,000 juvenile mothers. The above-mentioned situation in Poland calls for concrete actions on many levels: political, economic, educational, socio-cultural, and pastoral. In the context of this topic, some questions arise: what kind of pastoral activities has the Roman Catholic Church in Poland undertaken and should undertake in response to single parent families issues? What is the reception of Church

pastoral activities by single mothers? This presentation aims are to show the situation of single mothers in Poland, to show and evaluate the pastoral activities of the Catholic Church (including single-mother homes, the SOS fund, Caritas) and provide some examples of the expressions, comments, and experiences of single mothers.

Elzbieta Osewska is Professor at the State Higher Vocational School in Tarnów. She holds a Doctorate of Theology in Catechetics and a doctorate in Pastoral Theology. In 1990-1993 she was a lecturer in educational and catechetical centres in the former USSR (Catholic Religious Education, Christian Pedagogy, Family Catechesis and Pastoral Theology). In 1998-1999 she was the head of the Family Affairs Department in the Prime Minister's Office in Warsaw. From 1994 to 2014, she served as Catholic RE consultant and teacher trainer in the Teacher Training Centres in Suwalki and Lomza. From 1995-2015, she taught at Cardinal Wyszyński University.

### **Nathalie & Christian Mignonat**

Equipes RELIANCE / SEDIRE-Lyon, France

#### **Bartimaeus's Route: A Path for the Divorced and Remarried towards Receiving the Sacraments Again**

Created by the Teams of Our Lady (TOL) at the request of Pope John Paul II in the 2000s, RELIANCE teams welcome Christian couples in a new union who are progressing as a couple and as a team in the eyes of Christ. The team includes several remarried divorced couples, a sacramental couple (TOL), and a priest. The discernment process reviews the first union and its break, the healing of current relations with the former spouse and family, the fostering of stability in the new union, the setting up of peaceful relations with the Church, and a growth in personal spiritual life. Based on their 15 years of experience, the national coordinating team and its spiritual advisors of Equipes RELIANCE developed a questionnaire: "What do you want me to do for you?" (Mk 10, 46-52) in order to address the expectations of the team members. They formalized a "synodal discernment path" fitting perfectly with the "responsible personal and pastoral discernment" and the criteria of discernment proposed by *Amoris laetitia* (AL 300). Founded on Mk 10,46-52, this discernment path gathers couples engaged in a new union, members of the ecclesial community, and a priest. We call it "Bartimaeus's route". This paper presents "Bartimaeus's route" and its accomplishments as of 13 January 2018 in the parish community of Bron (France). "Bartimaeus's route" allows the return to the

sacraments for those who desire it, as well as the conversion of the parish community.

Nathalie Mignonat is a retired mathematics professor; Christian Mignonat is a retired engineer and canon lawyer (author of the report "The freedom of the marital consent, between free will and internal freedom"). He is also defender of the bond at the ecclesiastical court of Lyon (France). Married in 1976, they became members of the Teams of Our Lady in 1984, national coordinators for Equipes RELIANCE in France, co-founders of the SEDIRE-Lyon association accompanying "times of prayer" about a new union. They are involved in marriage preparation. As representatives of RELIANCE and SEDIRE they were invited as French auditors at the 2015 synod of bishops. They had the opportunity to present the contribution of both their movements: the "Emmaus ways" (spirit and domains of discernment for integration of divorced and remarried persons). "Bartimaeus's route" is the result of further reflection by RELIANCE members on *Amoris laetitia* aimed at integrating the conversion of the parish communities.

### **John C. Ries**

Carroll College, Helena, Montana, USA

#### **Love Troubled In and Through Inadequate Theological Anthropologies**

While much social, cultural, political, and ethical attention in the last half century has been brought to bear on the many deep challenges of "troubled love" that have come to be in many contemporary societies, theology has struggled to adequately respond. While there have been many and varied theological endeavors – from encyclicals to diocesan policies and parish practices, from "theologies of the body" to attitudes of mercy – these have tended to assume a normative or ideal paradigm of "untroubled love." Indeed, the Christian tradition has long assumed rather ahistorical understandings of "being human" and accordingly framed its understandings of human love therein. Perhaps our present-day struggles are actually more than a "troubled love" where theology needs to seek out adaptations, prudential judgments, mercy, etc., but instead have become a matter of engaging "love troubled" by mistaken and/or inadequate theological anthropologies that continue to frame any such "troubles." This paper will explain how anthropologies of subordination and complementarity have failed to incorporate how thoroughly historical our being human and our being in relation are, and as such have mis-framed the questions of today as "troubled love." It will then begin to consider a more radically embodied theological anthropology that recognizes "love

troubled” and opens the way for new questions concerning the mystery of human love and its opportunity for vital, even creational, weaving of historical particularities.

John C. Ries is an Associate Professor of Philosophical & Systematic Theology, Chair of the Theology Department, Faculty Dean, and holds the Schneller Professorship in Catholic Mission & Identity at Carroll College in Helena Montana, USA. He earned his B.A. in philosophy at Cardinal Glennon College in St. Louis. He studied theology for two years at the Pontificia Università Gregoriana in Rome, Italy. He earned his M.A. in philosophy from St. Louis University and his licentiate in philosophy from the Hoger Instituut Wijsbegeerte of the Katholieke Universiteit Leuven, Belgium. He also earned his M.A./S.T.L. and Ph.D/S.T.D. in theology at the Katholieke Universiteit Leuven. He was an associate researcher at the Faculty of Theology at Katholieke Universiteit Leuven (Centre for Liberation Theologies) for 9 years and has taught philosophy and theology at a number of colleges and universities. He presently works and teaches in the area of contemporary philosophical/systematic theology and liberation theologies, as well as teaching in the Great Books Honors Scholar Program at Carroll. Much of his scholarly and teaching work draws from theology at the intersection of disciplines including philosophy, literature, science, and socio-cultural and political studies.

### **Elvira Roncalli**

Carroll College, Helena, Montana, USA

#### **Love’s Trouble: Finding What We Lost, Losing What We Found**

Troubled love is the reality of lived out love. Love between two individuals, who are flesh and blood, is shaped by the space they inhabit and marked by the time they live. To think that it will remain the same, or that nothing can affect it, is to believe in a love that is not of this world. If love didn’t change, it wouldn’t be real, it wouldn’t even be. Yet change always comes not only with promises, but with perils as well. From the very outset, love is challenged by all sorts of beliefs and ideas we bring to it. They tend to turn into expectations and parameters by which to measure love: is what we feel, love? At the same time, when we find love, we assume it will always be there. A paradox looms, we seek love, but love hardly ever corresponds to a preconceived idea; once we find love, we forget that we may lose it, and in forgetfulness, we most likely will. Simone Weil writes that “attention is the most generous thing anyone can do,” and indeed attention is what love mostly needs, just as we need air to breathe. It opens up a space where lovers are present to one another. Fully. Unless this space is there, love isn’t. Hardly anything grows where there is no space to grow, and love

is no different. Love demands presence and presence is not given, it must be summoned. Love creates, and what it must create, most of all, is this space between lovers wherein they make themselves present to one another. With all that life brings: work, children, perhaps even illness, to keep this space alive is not easy to do. In fact, this space is often the first thing to vanish, and with that, the possibility to be and grow with one another. It comes as no surprise that losing love happens easily. There is much that stands in the way of love, and only attention can save it. In this paper, I intend to use Simone Weil’s notion of “attention” to bring to light the spontaneous, yet hard to sustain, force of love. Luce Irigaray’s work on how love needs a new language helps illustrate the originality and precariousness of love. Both point to something in love that goes against the idea of love as fixed and given. Rather, it must be brought continuously into presence, through attention, shaped and reshaped through words.

Elvira Roncalli is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Carroll College, Helena, Montana. She received her Ph.D. from the Université Catholique de Louvain-La-Neuve, in Belgium and her Laurea degree from the Università degli Studi di Milano, Italy. Prior to her appointment at Carroll, she worked as an Associate Researcher, at the Centre for Women’s Studies, within the Faculty of Theology, at the Katholieke Universiteit Leuven, and as a Full-time Researcher, at INTAMS, International Academy for Marital Spirituality in Brussels, Belgium. Her special interests include the philosophy of Hannah Arendt, Phenomenology, Italian Philosophy, Social and Political Philosophy, and Feminist/Gender Theory.

### **Sylvie Barth**

University of Strasbourg, France

#### **La voie de l’amour électif, un itinéraire de résilience pour chacun**

Comment aider l’Église du Pape François à soutenir les familles dans leur diversité? Selon notre hypothèse, le paradigme du «couple électif», résultant des mutations occidentales de la spiritualité et de la conjugalité, subsume toutes les formes d’unions. Or, fondé, mais aussi perpétué, sur la base de l’amour mutuel, en incluant un projet d’enfants, ce modèle cristallise une quête d’identité personnelle, de vérité relationnelle et d’équilibre de vie, considérée de nos jours comme «spirituelle»; on projette les valeurs conjugales anciennes sur l’amour électif comme «transcendance dans l’immanence». Mais s’aimer durablement en adultes, sans nier les limitations et les échecs, ni s’y résigner, est une ambition inégalée. Le motif biblique de «l’Esprit qui souffle où il veut», repris à Vatican II, encourage à la considérer. Penser chrétiennement les défis et

les ressources de «la voie de l'amour électif», et la «spiritualité coélective» qui y préside, permet de mieux l'accompagner: les éléments de systématisation proposés, spécifiés religieusement, doivent convenir à tous. Ici, la loi psychosociologique du don (J.-C. Sagne) sous-tend les catégories de la promesse et de l'alliance (chères à la Bible), débouchant sur l'intimité coélective/*communio personarum*. Comme communauté coélective/communauté de disciples missionnaires, le couple électif s'édifie dans l'implication, l'interaction et l'équité. Une telle créativité relève de l'expertise partagée et construit une véritable «résilience coélective». S'engager pour le «développement durable de l'amour» a ainsi du sens pour une Église attentive aux réalités et aux signes des temps.

### **The Path of Elective Love, an Itinerary of Resilience for Everyone**

How can we help the Church of Pope Francis support families in their diversity? According to my hypothesis, the paradigm of the “elective couple”, resulting from the Western mutations of spirituality and conjugality, subsumes all forms of union. Founded, but also perpetuated, on the basis of mutual love, including a desire for children, this model crystallizes a quest for personal identity, relational truth, and life balance, considered today as “spiritual”; bygone conjugal values are projected on elective love as “transcendence in immanence”. But loving each other as adults on a lasting basis, without denying or resigning oneself to limitations and failures, is an unparalleled ambition. The biblical motif of the “Spirit who blows where he wants”, taken from Vatican II, encourages us to consider it. To think in a Christian manner about the challenges and resources of the “way of elective love”, and the spirituality that regulates it, or “co-elective” spirituality, helps to provide better support: the elements of its systematization proposed, which can be religiously specified, must suit everyone. Here, the psychosociological “law of gift” (J. -C. Sagne) underlies the categories of promise and covenant (dear to the Bible), resulting in coelective intimacy/*communio personarum*. As a “co-elective community”/community of missionary disciples, the elective couple is built in involvement, interaction, and equity. Such creativity comes from shared expertise and builds true “co-elective resilience”. Commitment to the “sustainable development of love” thus makes sense for a Church attentive to the realities and signs of the times.

Sylvie BARTH, docteur en théologie catholique; agrégée de lettres classiques; permanente au mouvement Fondacio chrétiens pour le monde; chargée de mission

de 2005 à 2013 pour la mission de Fondacio sur quatre continents en direction des couples et les familles; chargée de cours à l'université de Strasbourg, septembre-janvier 2016-2017. Mariée et mère de famille nombreuse. Publications: BARTH Sylvie, «L'action associative chrétienne auprès des familles», in : DEHEUVELS N. et PAYA C. (dir.), *Famille et Conjugalité: Regards chrétiens pluridisciplinaires*, Charols : Ed. Excelsis, 2016, p. 509-521 ; BARTH Sylvie, «La voie de l'amour électif: vers une spiritualité chrétienne du couple contemporain», In : *Marriage, families & spirituality* 23 (2017); BARTH Sylvie, *La voie de l'amour électif: une interpellation spirituelle pour notre temps*, thèse de doctorat, Lit Verlag, collection INTAMS -Studies on Marriage and family, mars 2018.

Sylvie BARTH holds a doctorate in Catholic theology. She graduated in classical literature, holds a permanent position at the movement Fondacio, where she was in charge of mission from 2005 to 2013 for Fondacio's couples and families mission on four continents. She was lecturer at the University of Strasbourg from 2016-2017. She is married and is the mother of large family. Publications: BARTH Sylvie, “L'action associative chrétienne auprès des familles”, in: DEHEUVELS N. et PAYA C. (dir.), *Famille et Conjugalité: Regards chrétiens pluridisciplinaires*, Charols: Ed. Excelsis, 2016, p. 509-521; BARTH Sylvie, “La voie de l'amour électif: vers une spiritualité chrétienne du couple contemporain”, in: *Marriage, Families & Spirituality*, 23 (2017); BARTH Sylvie, *La voie de l' amour électif: une interpellation spirituelle pour notre temps*, doctoral thesis, Münster: Lit Verlag, collection INTAMS – Studies on Marriage and Family, February 2018.

### **Catherine Fino**

Institut catholique de Paris

#### **La cohérence du septénaire sacramentel au service de la mission des couples les plus fragiles.**

L'exhortation *Amoris laetitia* invite les pasteurs à faire confiance en la capacité de tous les couples à entreprendre un chemin de sanctification et à recevoir pour cela l'aide de l'Église. La proposition de ressources spirituelles est renouvelée par le fait que le pape François affirme la possibilité de la présence de la grâce dans la vie de personnes engagées dans des unions dites «irrégulières», mais des doutes se sont exprimés sur la validité de cette proposition. Nous faisons l'hypothèse qu'il est possible d'éclairer ce débat en prenant en compte un cadre ecclésial et sacramentaire plus large que le conditionnement réciproque entre les critères pour accéder au sacrement de la réconciliation et au mariage sacramentel. Nous analyserons successivement la restauration de la liberté baptismale qui sous-tend l'engagement des conjoints au concile de Trente, l'introduction au concile Vatican II de la perspective de l'Alliance qui

souligne les conditions morales de la réponse fidèle au don de Dieu, et enfin la nécessité, pour prendre en compte la complexité de la vie des couples et des familles, de remettre l'exigence de conversion morale dans l'ensemble du cadre ecclésial et sacramentaire posé dès le concile de Trente. Nous pouvons ainsi compléter l'effort de discernement pour évaluer la responsabilité individuelle et tracer un chemin de croissance morale appuyé sur la grâce, par la prise en compte de la responsabilité ecclésiale dans l'envoi en mission des plus vulnérables, tel qu'il est signifié par exemple dans le sacrement des malades.

### **The Coherence of the Seven Sacraments at the Service of the Mission of the Most Fragile Couples**

The exhortation *Amoris laetitia* invites pastors to trust in the capacity of all couples to embark on a path of sanctification and receive the help of the Church for this. The availability of spiritual resources is underlined by the fact that Pope Francis affirms the possibility of the presence of grace in the lives of people engaged in unions said to be "irregular", but doubts have been raised regarding the validity of Francis's proposition. I suggest that it is possible to clarify this debate by taking into account an ecclesial and sacramental framework broader than one that considers only the conditions of access to the sacraments of reconciliation and marriage. I analyse the restoration of baptismal freedom that underlies the engagement of spouses at the Council of Trent, the introduction, during the Second Vatican Council, of the perspective of covenant which highlights the moral conditions for the faithful response to the gift of God, and lastly, the necessity of taking into account the complex lives of couples and families in situating the demands of moral conversion within the whole of the ecclesial and sacramental framework laid out since the Council of Trent. We might thus complete the effort of discernment to evaluate individual responsibility and trace a path of moral development supported by grace, through the consideration of ecclesial responsibility for sending the most vulnerable on mission, as signified, for example, in the sacrament of the sick.

Catherine Fino, religieuse salésienne de Don Bosco, docteur en médecine et en théologie, est Professeur au Theologicum à l'Institut Catholique de Paris, Directrice du Département de théologie morale et spirituelle. Elle enseigne la théologie morale familiale et sexuelle depuis 4 ans. Sa recherche porte également sur l'hospitalité et les pratiques sociales de charité, les anthropologies contemporaines et la normativité, l'éthique et l'éducation. Publications récentes: *Sortir du moralisme: Catéchèse, pédagogie d'initiation et formation du sujet moral*,

Paris: Artège-Desclée, 2014 ; *Pédagogie divine: L'action de Dieu dans la diversité des familles*, Paris: Cerf, 2015; «La sacramentalité du mariage: Enjeux et défis pour la théologie morale», in : *La Maison-Dieu*, n°289, 2017/3, p. 67-79.

Catherine Fino, Salesian Sister, is a medical doctor with a doctorate in theology. She is a professor at the Theologicum of the Catholic Institute of Paris, and Director of the Department of Moral and Spiritual Theology. She has taught family and sexual moral theology for 4 years. Her research also concerns hospitality and the social practices of charity, contemporary anthropologies and normativity, ethics, and education. Recent publications: *Sortir du moralisme: Catéchèse, pédagogie d'initiation et formation du sujet moral*, Paris: Artège-Desclée, 2014; *Pédagogie divine: L'action de Dieu dans la diversité des familles*, Paris: Cerf, 2015 ; «La sacramentalité du mariage: Enjeux et défis pour la théologie morale», in: *La Maison-Dieu*, n°289, 2017/3, p. 67-79.

### **Bernard Kasamata Kamulinso**

KU Leuven

#### **La pastorale des familles chrétiennes subsahariennes aux prises avec les «mirages» de l'amour: Plaidoyer pour une spiritualité intégrante et inclusive**

Des chrétiens catholiques pratiquants de l'Afrique sub-saharienne sont privés des sacrements et parfois des funérailles chrétiennes en raison de leur «union matrimoniale irrégulière», puisque la doctrine catholique du mariage considère toutes les formes du mariage africain comme étant le concubinage, assimilé au péché public. De ce fait, les concernés sont, en plus de la privation sacramentelle, exclus des responsabilités à toutes les instances de l'Église. Des théologiens comme Vincent Mulago et Laurent Mpongo, ont abordé cette question en revisitant l'histoire de l'Église notamment le processus de l'élaboration de la forme canonique du mariage, empreinte de culture occidentale de l'époque. Voilà une brèche qui peut ouvrir l'espace au débat et au dialogue. Or, il s'avère que peu d'intérêt a été porté à la spiritualité et aux aspirations profondes de ces couples marginalisés. De ce fait, nous suggérons une réflexion qui prendra en compte la vie spirituelle de ces couples et saisira les «mirages» de leur amour comme étant le «kaïros», ce lieu favorable pour l'exercice d'une spiritualité inclusive, dans une église appelée à se considérer comme la «shekina de Dieu» (= maison de Dieu), ouverte pour accueillir tous ses enfants. Nous estimons nécessaire de fonder cette spiritualité sur le concept de «jamaa», terme shahili qui veut dire: foyer ou feu qui réchauffe, rapproche et ranime.

## Ministry to Sub-Saharan Christian Families in Caught up in “Mirages” of Love: A Call for an Integral and Inclusive Spirituality

Practicing Catholics living in Sub-Saharan Africa are deprived of the sacraments and at times even Christian funerals because of their “irregular marriages”, since Catholic teaching considers all forms of African marriage to be mere concubinage and thus public sin. Those in these relationships are excluded from both the sacraments and any Church responsibilities. Theologians like Vincent Mulago and Laurent Mpongo have broached this question in revisiting the history of the Church, especially the way in which the canonical form of marriage was shaped by the western culture of the period. It is here that a space for debate and dialogue can be found. This is particularly of interest for the spirituality and deep aspirations of these marginalized couples. In this paper, I propose a reflection that takes into account the spiritual life of these couples and sees the “mirages” of their love as a *kairos*, an opportunity for the exercise of an inclusive spirituality in a Church called to consider itself as the “shekina of God” (house of God), open to welcome all of her children. I believe that it is necessary to ground this spirituality on the concept of “jamaa”, a Swahili word that means “hearth” or fire that warms, draws close, and revives.

Bernard Kasamata Kamulinso was born in 1973 (RD Congo). After joining the Salvatorian fathers in 1997, he obtained bachelor’s degrees in Philosophy (2003) and in Theology (2008). In 2015, he obtained a master’s degree in Pastoral Theology at the KU Leuven, where he is a PHD student. His research interests are related to the question of remarried and divorced people in the western Churches, and “irregular marital situations” in Africa (or African marriages).

## Wellars Uwamahoro

KU Leuven

### Revisiter la solidarité familiale et intergénérationnelle à l'heure du vieillissement démographique

Nous assistons à une mutation de la famille traditionnelle à une nouvelle conception de la famille et des relations intergénérationnelles suite à la révolution démographique et au vieillissement qui en découle. En effet, la population mondiale a connu une croissance spectaculaire allant de 1 milliard en 1804 à 7 milliard en 2011 (Livi-Bacci, 2012). Cependant, au lieu de l’explosion démographique, l’heure est au vieillissement, conséquence de la hausse d’espérance de vie et de la baisse de fécondité: les hommes

vivent plus longtemps, avec moins d’enfants. Déjà fort au Nord, le vieillissement tend à la mondialisation et il sera plus rapide au Sud qu’au Nord (Pison (2009). Au-delà des chiffres, il y a la personne âgée au visage singulier, dans son contexte, et des défis à affronter. Jadis au centre de la vie familiale comme bibliothèque vivante, réunissant le savoir, l’avoir et le pouvoir en plus d’être médiateur entre les vivants et les morts, la personne âgée est passée de la vénération à la perte de son autonomie, à la dépendance et à l’abandon pour vieillir seule. Notre contribution se veut un essai de reconstruction de l’éthique normative du Décalogue «tu honoreras ton père et ta mère (Ex 20,12)», pour apprécier le fondement théologico-éthique des droits de la personne âgée et de la responsabilité des enfants et de la famille (Houtman, 2000). Cependant, ladite responsabilité filiale a ses limites car il y a des personnes âgées sans enfants et sans famille; d’où la nécessité du concours de la solidarité comme nouvelle vertu chrétienne et principe éthique ainsi que du grand commandement de l’Amour pour une vieillesse humaine et digne.

### Revisiting Family and Intergenerational Solidarity in the Wake of an Ageing Population

We are currently witnessing a shift from traditional family to an emerging family concept, as well as a change in intergenerational relationships, all this being the consequence of a demographic revolution and its resulting population ageing. In fact, the world’s population has grown spectacularly, rising from 1 billion in 1804 to 7 billion in 2011 (Livi-Bacci, 2012). However, instead of a demographic explosion, what we are now observing is the ageing of the population which results from increased life expectancy and fertility decline. Incidentally, people not only live longer, but also do so with fewer children. The already more pronounced ageing in the north is spreading worldwide. It will soon be faster in the south than in the north (Pison, 2009). Beyond the bare numbers, I consider here the circumstances of the aging seniors and the challenges they face. In the past, seniors played a central role in the family, that of a living library. They had knowledge, assets, and power, in addition to being the mediator between the living and the dead. At present, seniors have shifted from being venerated to being abandoned. Most of them are forced to grow old alone. My proposal attempts to rebuild a normative ethics as set out in the Decalogue, which reads: “You shall honour your father and your mother” (Ex 20,12) in order to articulate the theological and ethical basis for both the rights of seniors and the responsibility incumbent on the children and on

the family (Houtman, 2000). However, this family responsibility has its limitations: the fact is that there are childless seniors as well as elderly individuals without any family. All these factors add to the need to foster solidarity as a new Christian virtue and ethical principle, as well as to reassert the greatest commandment of love for a humanly dignified old age.

Wellars Uwamahoro is a PhD Student, member of Research Unit Theological and Comparative Ethics in the Faculty of Theology of the KU Leuven. He has a master's degree in Demography (UCL). His doctoral research deals with theological and ethical issues related to demographic dynamics and population policies. He is a parish priest in Braine-le-Château (Belgium).

### **Dorothea Wojtczak**

Philosophisch-Theologische Hochschule Sankt Georgen

#### ***Amoris Laetitia*: Personale Identität als Ausdruck familiärer Identität: Außergewöhnliche Familiensituationen als Herausforderung für die Kirche.**

Die personale Identität besteht strukturell auf der Beziehung zur Andersheit: zum Leib, zum Gewissen und zu den Mitmenschen. Diese Relation ist keinesfalls nur funktional, sondern sie beruht auf der ethischen Orientierung am guten und gerechten Leben. Zugleich nimmt diese Sichtweise den gebrochenen Körper und den Menschen in den Blick. Sobald eine physische oder psychische Behinderung einen Menschen oder eine Familie betrifft, wird jedes Streben nach Human Enhancement durchbrochen. Eine personale Identität wird gebrochen und somit auch die familiäre Identität, da sie Ausdruck der familiären Identität ist. Die Rolle, die in diesem Kontext die Kirche in der Begegnung mit außergewöhnlichen Menschen und Familiensituationen einnimmt, ist nicht zweifelsfrei. Schließlich nennt c. 1095 zahlreiche Kriterien, aus denen es physisch und psychisch beeinträchtigten Menschen nicht erlaubt, ist eine Ehe zu schließen. Auch wird ausgespart, wie die pastorale Sorge um die beeinträchtigten Menschen, die Eltern und Familien beeinträchtigter Menschen genau ermöglicht wird. Insofern scheint es ein Desiderat für die Kirche zu sein, außergewöhnliche Familiensituationen anzunehmen und ein wahrhaft humanes Leben zu verwirklichen.

### **Personal Identity as an Expression of Familial Identity: Exceptional Family Circumstances as a Challenge for the Church**

Personal Identity is structurally based on the relation to that which is different: the body, the conscience, and one's fellow person. This relation is in not merely functional; rather, it rests on the ethical norm of a good and just life. At the same time, this angle takes into account the broken body and the person. Once a physical or mental disability concerns a person or a family, every aspiration to human enhancement falls apart. A personal identity is broken, and with it the identity of a family, because the former is the expression of the latter. The Church's role in the context of these impaired people and their family situations is not without doubt. Canon 1095 gives multiple criteria that make it impossible for physically or mentally disabled people to validly contract a marriage. Furthermore, the way of providing pastoral care to those affected by disability and their families is not discussed. In this regard, it seems desirable to accept extraordinary family situations as a challenge to the Church to foster a truly human existence.

Dorothea Wojtczak, katholische Theologin (Mag. theol.) mit dem ersten Staatsexamen für das Lehramt an Gymnasien in katholischer Religionslehre, Philosophie und Biologie, Referentin für Glaube und Wissenschaft in der Katholischen Studierenden- und Hochschulgemeinde Münster, Doktorandin bei Prof. Dr. Dirk Ansorge an der Philosophisch-Theologischen Hochschule Sankt Georgen, Frankfurt am Main, und Wissenschaftliche Hilfskraft im DFG-Netzwerk „Schuld ErTragen. Die Kirche und ihre Schuld“ unter der Leitung von Dr. habil. Julia Enxing an der Philosophisch-Theologischen Hochschule, Frankfurt am Main. Buchbeiträge: „Recht und billig?! Die Spannung von Schuld und Barmherzigkeit im Hinblick auf die *aequitas canonica*“, in: *Confessio: Schuld bekennen in Kirche und Öffentlichkeit*, herausgegeben von Julia Enxing und Jutta Koslowski. Beihefte zur Ökumenischen Rundschau 118, Leipzig: Evangelische Verlagsanstalt 2018. [in Vorbereitung] Rezensionen: Rezension zu Adrian Loretan: *Wahrheitsansprüche im Kontext der Freiheitsrechte*. Religionsrechtliche Studien 3. Zürich 2017. In: [www.feinschwarz.net](http://www.feinschwarz.net). [im Erscheinen] Vorträge: „Volo, ut sis!“. Schöpfung als anthropologische Herausforderung (gehalten am 07.12.2017 Im Rahmen der Vortragsreihe „Vernünftig glauben?!“ in Münster/Westf.)

Dorothea Wojtczak is a Catholic theologian (Magister theologiae), with a license to teach Catholic Religious Education, Philosophy, and Biology at elementary schools. She is a Consultant for Faith and Science at the Catholic Students' Community in Münster. She is currently studying for a doctorate at the Philosophical-Theological College of Sankt Georgen in Frankfurt under Professor

Dr. Dirk Ansorge and is a Research Assistant at the German Research Network (DFG) "Schuld ErTragen. Die Kirche und ihre Schuld" under the direction of Dr. habil. Julia Enxing at the Philosophical-Theological College of Sankt Georgen, Frankfurt.